Est.	YORK
1841	ST JOHN
	UNIVERSITY

Klockare, E., Olsson, L. F., Gustafsson,

H. and Hill, Andrew P. ORCID logoORCID: https://orcid.org/0000-0001-6370-8901 (2022) Sport Psychology Consultants' Views on Working with Perfectionistic Elite athletes. The Sport Psychologist., 36 (3). pp. 219-227.

Downloaded from: https://ray.yorksj.ac.uk/id/eprint/6465/

The version presented here may differ from the published version or version of record. If you intend to cite from the work you are advised to consult the publisher's version: https://journals.humankinetics.com/view/journals/tsp/aop/article-10.1123-tsp.2021-0055/ article-10.1123-tsp.2021-0055.xml

Research at York St John (RaY) is an institutional repository. It supports the principles of open access by making the research outputs of the University available in digital form. Copyright of the items stored in RaY reside with the authors and/or other copyright owners. Users may access full text items free of charge, and may download a copy for private study or non-commercial research. For further reuse terms, see licence terms governing individual outputs. Institutional Repository Policy Statement



Research at the University of York St John For more information please contact RaY at <u>ray@yorksj.ac.uk</u>

	Klockare, E., Olsson, L. F., Gustafsson, H., Lundqvist, C. & Hill, A P. (2022). Sport Psychology Consultants' Views on Working with Perfectionistic Elite Athletes. The Sport Psychologist. Accepted 03-06-22. [Author accepted version]
1	
2	
3	
4	
5	
6	Sport Psychology Consultants' Views on Working with Perfectionistic Elite
7	Athletes
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	

#### Abstract

The purpose of this study was to explore the views and experiences of sport psychology consultants who have worked with perfectionistic elite athletes and, particularly, their views on the use of cognitive behavioral therapy (CBT). Semi-structured interviews were conducted with four professional sport psychology consultants who identified themselves as having experience of working with athletes they consider to be perfectionistic. Two themes were generated: manifestations of perfectionism and management of perfectionism. The consultants found perfectionistic athletes to have rigid attitudes and strong negative emotional experiences, to use safety behaviors and to regularly underperform. CBT techniques such as mindfulness, cognitive restructuring, and psychological skills training were most commonly used and were largely viewed as effective against a backdrop of sporting environment that could often encourage athletes to be perfectionistic. The findings highlight the complexity of perfectionism from a consultancy perspective and the potential challenges associated with working with perfectionistic athletes. *Keywords:* cognitive behavioral therapy, elite athletes, perfectionism, sport psychology consultants 

- 1
- 23

# Sport Psychology Consultants' Views on Working with Perfectionistic Elite Athletes

4 To be successful in elite sport athletes are required to perform exceptionally and even, 5 at times, perfectly (Hill et al., 2020). Sport psychology consultants can therefore expect to frequently encounter athletes who are perfectionistic. However, so far, research in sport 6 7 psychology has focused exclusively on better understanding the consequences of being 8 perfectionistic for athletes with little attention to the experiences of those who are tasked with 9 supporting them. Given its complexity, perfectionism is likely to pose several challenges for 10 sport psychology consultants and may require particular skills in order to safeguard athlete 11 welfare while maximising their performance. With this in mind, the current study gathers the 12 views of sport psychology consultants who identified themselves as having worked with 13 perfectionistic athletes with the aim of sharing professional experiences and promoting 14 effective practice in this area.

15 Research suggests that perfectionism includes two main features: perfectionistic strivings (PS) and perfectionistic concerns (PC). PS capture self-oriented striving for 16 17 perfection and unrealistically high personal performance standards whereas PC capture 18 concerns over making mistakes, fear of negative social evaluation, and negative reactions to 19 imperfection (Gotwals et al., 2012). These dimensions are typically studied in a way that 20 allows their separate effects to be examined (viz. an independent effect approach) or are 21 combined to examine different combinations. When doing the later, combinations of variables 22 or groups are created that include higher and lower levels of PS and PC and they are 23 compared with each other in terms of different outcomes (e.g., high PS/high PC versus low 24 PS/low PC in regards to athlete performance).

## WORKING WITH PERFECTIONISTIC ELITE ATHLETES

1 The majority of research in sport has focused on the separate effects of dimensions of 2 perfectionism and indicates they are related to a wide range of motivation, performance, and 3 wellbeing outcomes in sport. In the most recent review in this area (Hill et al., 2018), for 4 example, PC was revealed to be associated with various undesirable attitudes (e.g., low self-5 esteem), emotions (e.g., high anxiety), and behaviors (e.g., avoidance coping). Notably, this 6 included some particularly worrying outcomes such as burnout and depressive symptoms. By 7 contrast, PS was more ambiguous and displayed a mixed pattern of associations depending on 8 the outcome measured. For example, PS was positively related to worry, self-criticism, and 9 anxiety, but also positively related to enjoyment, confidence, and athletic performance. 10 Examining combinations or subtypes of PS and PC has helped further understanding of 11 perfectionistic athletes (Hill et al., 2020). Here, when using the term "perfectionistic athletes", 12 we are referring to athletes that display the qualities of perfectionism to some, typically 13 higher, degree. There are two major ways of studying athletes in this way. The first is the 14 tripartite model that compares three subtypes: maladaptive (high PS/high PC), adaptive (high 15 PS/low PC), and non-perfectionism (low PS/high PC). The second is the  $2 \times 2$  model that compares four subtypes: pure PS (high PS/low PC), pure PC (low PS/high PC), mixed 16 17 perfectionism (high PS/high PC), and non-perfectionism (low PS/low PC). Research suggests 18 that the most problematic subtype is low PS/high PC, followed by high PS/high PC, and then 19 high PS/low PC (Hill & Madigan, 2017). Of note, the combination of high PS/low PC may 20 have some benefits that include better performance in comparison to the other subtypes. 21 However, the benefits of this subtype relative to other non-perfectionistic subtypes remain 22 unclear (see Gaudreau, 2019).

While these types of quantitative studies in sport have helped provide a picture of some of the effects of perfectionism, among the most revealing studies have been those that have described the experiences of athletes in a qualitative manner. These qualitative studies have

provided a rich account of the various ways perfectionism manifests in the lives of athletes 1 2 and how perfectionistic athletes give meaning to their participation in a manner that reflect 3 particular goals, values, and purposes (Mallinson-Howard et al., 2018). Being perfectionistic is reported as being highly energising and motivational but is also accompanied by accounts 4 of difficultly refocusing after mistakes and being overly self-critical (Gotwals & Spencer-5 6 Cavaliere, 2014; Sellars et al., 2016). On the negative side, stress and anxiety are also 7 common, as is an obsessional focus on performance to the detriment of other aspects of their 8 lives (Hill et al., 2015). In these ways, it is evident that some perfectionistic athletes have 9 experiences in sport that may be detrimental to their health and performance. 10 In reflecting on this research, it is evident that many of the issues raised lend themselves 11 to the support of sport psychology consultants. However, to date, research has exclusively 12 focused on the experiences of perfectionistic athletes and, as of yet, no research has sought to 13 gain the perspectives of the practitioners working with perfectionistic athletes. Doing so is 14 valuable in that it offers unique insight into the ways sports psychology consultants consider 15 perfectionism to manifest in sport. Drawing on their personal experiences, it will also help identify some of the strategies that they found effective when working with perfectionistic 16 17 athletes and the challenges that perfectionism or the setting poses when undertaking their 18 practical work. Ultimately, this information will contribute to a better understanding of 19 perfectionism in sport and help perfectionistic athletes who need support. 20 In the current study we are particularly interested in the use of Cognitive Behavioral 21 Therapy (CBT). Perfectionism is notoriously difficult to work with in clinical settings (Egan 22 et al., 2013). However, based on current evidence, CBT is among the most effective ways to 23 address perfectionism (see Lloyd et al., 2015). When using CBT different techniques are used

24 for cognitive restructuring, such as cognitive reappraisal, attention deployment, situation

25 modification, and mindfulness (Hofmann et al., 2013). Recently, a strand of CBT termed

Acceptance and Commitment Therapy (ACT; Hayes et al., 1996), that focuses on acceptance of emotions and thoughts rather than trying to change them, has also been found to be useful when addressing perfectionism (Ong et al., 2019a, b). These techniques are increasingly used by sport psychology consultants and are now a routine part of many consultants' practice. As such, we considered exploring the use of these techniques an appropriate starting point in order to begin to understand the experiences of those working with perfectionistic athletes.

#### 7 **Purpose of the study**

8 The purpose of the study was to explore the views and experiences of sport psychology 9 consultants regarding working with perfectionistic elite athletes, particularly as it pertains to 10 using a CBT approach. To this end, qualitative methods were used to gain detailed 11 information on (a) how they considered perfectionism to manifest in athletes they worked 12 with, and (b) how they used CBT techniques in their work with these athletes.

13

#### Method

# 14 **Recruitment and Participants**

15 Through purposive sampling, four professional sport psychology consultants were identified. The consultants, all based in Sweden, were contacted by the third author and 16 17 informed about the aim of the study, procedures, and ethical considerations (e.g., voluntary 18 participation, confidentiality, right to withdraw). Informed consent was provided by all 19 participants before the interviews. For the current study we followed the Swedish national 20 legislation and the study does not fall within the scope of The Act (2003:460) Concerning the 21 Ethical Review of Research Involving Humans (SFS 2003:460) as it does not include any 22 methods intended to physically or mentally influence the person participating in the research 23 or pose obvious risk to the participants. We carefully followed the guidelines regarding Good 24 *Research Practice* from the Swedish Research Council (2017) throughout the study.

## WORKING WITH PERFECTIONISTIC ELITE ATHLETES

1 In regards to recruitment, all participants were approached based on initial 2 recommendations by sports federations and other sport psychology consultants. 3 Recommendations were based on expertise using CBT, extensive experience (more than five years) of working with elite athletes and specifically experience working with perfectionistic 4 5 athletes. The participants had at least an Undergraduate Diploma in Psychotherapy. Specifically, they all had basic training in sport psychology counselling, with specialization in 6 7 elite sports. This includes a one-year education in psychotherapeutic methods, diagnostics and 8 psychopathology, and supervised counselling and sport psychology with a focus on elite 9 sports. Experience of working with athletes that the consultants considered "perfectionistic" 10 was confirmed as part of recruitment to the study; all participants reported that they had 11 worked with ten or more athletes with perfectionistic features. Names used here are 12 pseudonyms.

At the time of the study, Lucas was completing his Ph.D. in Sport Psychology, working as a lecturer at a university, and providing sport psychology consultancy to junior and senior elite athletes, including an elite soccer team. He had a Master's degree in Sport Psychology and a background as a professional coach in an individual sport. He had worked more than six years as a sport psychology consultant with various sports but mainly focusing on team sport athletes. Lucas had an Undergraduate Diploma in Cognitive Behavioral Psychotherapy, with specialization in elite sports as well as additional courses in ACT.

Elise was working at a university as a lecturer in Sport Psychology, and as a sport psychology consultant for both individual and team sports at junior, senior, elite and sub-elite level. She had been an accredited sport psychologist at world championships, senior level, and worked with several youth national teams. Elise had a Master's degree in Sport Psychology and an Undergraduate Diploma in Cognitive Behavioral Psychotherapy, with specialization in

7

# WORKING WITH PERFECTIONISTIC ELITE ATHLETES

elite sports. She had a background in team sports and extensive experience as a consultant,
 working with both traditional sport psychology services and clinical issues.

3 Adam worked as a sport psychology consultant and counsellor at a sport academy, and was lecturing in Sport Psychology at a university. He had a Master's degree in Sport 4 Psychology and an Undergraduate Diploma in Cognitive Behavioral Psychotherapy, with 5 6 specialization in elite sports. Adam had worked more than five years as a sport psychology 7 consultant with youth, junior and elite athletes from various team and individual sports, 8 including participants in the Olympics and world championships. As he combined his job 9 with both sport psychology services and counselling his experience included not only sport 10 psychology services but also clinical issues.

11 Rafael worked at a sports medicine clinic as a sport psychology consultant, mainly with 12 athletes from team sports. He had a Master's degree in Sport Pedagogy, a Bachelor's degree 13 in Sport Psychology, and a Graduate Diploma in Cognitive Behavioral Psychotherapy. He had 14 also completed additional courses in ACT. He had worked more than six years as a sport 15 psychology consultant. Rafael was the main sport psychologist with an elite soccer team and 16 had been an accredited sport psychologist at the Paralympics.

17 When seeking to examine the accounts of perfectionistic athletes directly, researchers 18 have used a range of approaches to identify participants such as sub-scale scores (e.g., Sellars 19 et al., 2016) or classifications (e.g., Mallinson-Howard et al., 2018). Some research has also 20 used athletes who have self-identified as perfectionists (e.g., Hill et al., 2015). In the current 21 study an approach akin to the latter was used, as the consultants identified athletes they had 22 worked with as perfectionistic. The authors accepted these assertions as legitimate and valid 23 based on the consultants' background of having worked with a multitude of athletes including 24 ones that are more or less perfectionistic. We consider this a strength, as our aims are to 25 capture their experiences. However, it also means that there would be possible differences in

what each consultant would consider perfectionistic and differences to consultants not
 included in the current study.

#### 3 Interview

4 Semi-structured interviews were used to enable the participants to freely explain and 5 talk about their experiences in detail, in conjunction with addressing the research question. An 6 interview guide was developed with open-ended questions (see Appendix). The questions 7 focused on how perfectionism manifested among the athletes, the perceived contributing 8 factors that increased perfectionistic behaviors and attitudes among the athletes, and which 9 type of methods the consultants used when they had worked with the athletes and the results. 10 The participants' general views on perfectionism in sport, from their experiences as 11 consultants, were also brought up. A series of standard probes and prompts were also 12 developed and used. The interviews were conducted by the third author over the telephone, at 13 a convenient time for the participants. Interviews lasted between 25 and 35 minutes and were 14 audio-recorded with the participants' permission. Shorter follow-up conversations were also 15 conducted with all participants by the third author to enable clarifications and confirmations.

# 16 Data Analysis

17 Interviews were transcribed verbatim and reflexive thematic analysis with its six 18 recursive phases (Braun & Clarke, 2019; Terry et al., 2017) was undertaken by the first 19 author. First, the transcripts were read and re-read so the analyst became familiarized with the 20 data. Preliminary notes were taken throughout the familiarization stage. Second, initial codes 21 of interesting features of the data ("meaning units") were generated (e.g., words and phrases 22 that occurred throughout the transcripts or seemed especially pertinent to the research 23 question). Third, the initial codes were sifted and sorted until a set of possible themes were 24 developed in an inductive manner. Fourth, the possible themes were reviewed and refined 25 with the codes and the entire data set. A thematic map of analysis was generated that reflected the thematic structure. Fifth, themes were defined and named, as well as categories. Finally, in
 the sixth phase, representative and compelling data extracts were selected to accompany our
 account of the findings and the result section was written.

# 4 Data Quality

5 The third author, a sport psychology consultant with a background as a coach and 6 athlete, conducted all interviews to facilitate rapport and in-depth responses by using the same vocabulary as the respondents as well as having good contextual knowledge of the sport 7 8 environment (Eklund, 1993). This together with a narrow study aim and purposefully sampled 9 participants with relevant experiences increased information power, and therefore a lower 10 number of participants was deemed appropriate (Malterud et al., 2016). The qualitative 11 approach in this study is not meant to generalize but to give the perspectives of the people 12 involved, looking at the meaning the participants place on their experiences through open-13 ended questions and direct quotations (Yilmaz, 2013). Throughout the data analysis process, 14 memoing was practiced where reflective thoughts and initial ideas were recorded (Birks et al., 15 2008). The analysis process was discussed between the first and third author who both have previous experience in conducting semi-structured interviews and using thematic analysis. 16 17 Thereafter to enhance rigor, the second author acted as a critical friend (Smith & McGannon, 18 2018), giving feedback on the analysis, promoting reflexivity, and offering new interpretive 19 possibilities.

20

#### Results

#### 21 Overview

When the consultants described their experiences from working with athletes who demonstrated perfectionistic features two overarching themes were generated. The first theme consisted of the manifestations of perfectionism in their clients (athletes). In particular, athletes' attitudes, emotions, behaviors, and outcomes were described. The second theme 1 consisted of issues associated with the management of perfectionism in athletes. Here,

2 consultants' approaches, methods, and challenges were described.

# 3 Manifestations of Perfectionism

Four categories were developed when the consultants recounted how perfectionism
manifested among athletes they had worked with: attitudes, emotions, behaviors, and
outcomes.

# 7 Attitudes

8 The consultants reported that the dominant attitude among perfectionistic athletes was 9 that everything had to be perfect, not only their performances but also the surroundings at 10 competitions as well as their personal lives. Rafael explained: "It's not that perfectionism is only in the sport, for many all other performances overall should be perfect, regardless of 11 12 what it concerns. If it's about relationships, or if it's about the school, or if it's about some 13 job." Concerning sport, the athletes were perceived to have particular difficulty with being 14 satisfied and felt inadequate even when they performed well, as Adam described: "no matter 15 the performance, they are never really satisfied. [Their attitude] is even if you achieve your goal, you could have done a little bit more." Adam also saw an extreme and irrational mindset 16 17 in several athletes he had worked with exemplified by the sense that "I have to be perfect 18 otherwise I'm nothing." Elise and Rafael similarly articulated that some athletes displayed 19 performance-based self-worth which they believed to be part of their perfectionism. 20 Alongside this mindset, Adam, Rafael, and Lucas identified an "all or nothing" attitude. 21 This attitude was illustrated by Rafael who recounted a soccer players' view on a game: 22 If he didn't perform perfectly directly when the game started, the whole day was ruined 23 [...] he misses the first passing in the first minute and he says "then it's over, then I 24 can't play" [...] "are you saying that it's 89 minutes of wasted time during the rest of 25 the game?" He just "yes, basically yes" That was his view on it.

11

Dwelling on mistakes and poor performances was also described as common among
perfectionistic athletes which in turn was considered to affect their ability to focus on the
present, as recounted by Elise from working with a referee: "when he did something wrong he
got stuck in that instead of [focusing on the present], and of course that interfered with his
performance as a referee. Going around thinking about some decision that happened five
minutes ago."

7 Some athletes were described as displaying a pessimistic view of their sports and lives in general. Adam recalled: "Pre-season went great. He outclassed those he usually ran even 8 9 with and then he said 'wonder when it'll go badly again?'" Elise and Adam articulated that 10 some athletes focused on not failing instead of performing well, as Adam explained in the 11 following: "because you want to do everything perfect you do not want to make a fool out of 12 yourself, and then you want to make sure that you avoid failure which results in that you don't 13 perform your best either." In the view of Lucas, Elise, and Adam, this approach was 14 compounded by an especially strong attachment to the sport displayed by the athletes. Lucas's 15 description of working with one athlete, in particular, illustrated this:

16 [when we] talked about how the last year had looked and the last years had looked, this

17 person did not remember anything other than working out, competing, sleeping and

18 eating [...] somehow the whole journey was lost [...] this person [could] not say

19 anything about family or friends or work.

# 20 *Emotions*

All consultants reported that they found unpleasant emotions linked to performance and sport to be common among perfectionistic athletes. In their experience, perfectionistic athletes described performance anxiety and doubt, as well as uneasiness regarding uncertainty at competitions and possible consequences of their performance. Adam recounted the following statement from an athlete when describing the basis for these emotions: "'there's a risk that

12

I'm not perfect, I could lose the ball or miss a pass if I play advanced.'" Further, Lucas
 recalled an athlete expressing shame and guilt associated with the outcome of the sport
 performance, making excuses and not taking responsibility: "If it's going bad I easily blame
 it on other things [...] I can't jump when it's windy, or it has to be cloudy, or it's sun [...] it's
 embarrassing to fail.""

6 The consultants reported that athletes expressed fear of failure, often to the degree 7 where the fear took over and was their main focus. Lucas, Elise, and Adam recounted that 8 such fear of failure held back athletes in trying, as well as developing new approaches for 9 their training as Lucas expressed: "You don't dare to try because there's a stronger fear in 10 failing [...] you don't really dare to expose yourself to, for example, a different diet, or a more laid-back attitude, or a different approach." Further, some of the negative emotions were 11 12 thought to reflect disrupted routines and re-planned activities which perfectionistic athletes 13 were considered to have trouble coping with. Lucas described how a suggestion of a small 14 change in the meal plan evoked anxiety and fear in the athlete:

15 [we were about to] have lunch, and this was two weeks before a championship, and I 16 said "should we go and grab a burger?" and then this person flew up from his chair and 17 told me that it was almost like threatening [him] with a gun. He experienced the same 18 anxiety.

Adam also described how the athletes' motivation could shift throughout the career, althoughextrinsic motivation was often dominant:

at the beginning of the sport career, it might be positive because it's fun to be perfect
because then I get attention and I receive praise and I'm mentioned in the papers [...]
you always start out because it's fun or because it's socially, or the movement itself, is
great fun [...] But unfortunately, more and more of the ones we see, it has become
something negative, "I don't want to fail, I don't want to make a fool out of myself, I

want to be selected for the team, I have to qualify for the Olympics" [...] somewhere
 along the way it's lost. And for some, it might be related to perfectionistic features.
 *Behaviors*

4 To avoid or reduce unpleasant emotions the consultants reported that the athletes used 5 different safety behaviors. Avoidance coping strategies were used by some athletes where 6 they avoided situations where the results were considered uncertain, as illustrated by Adam: 7 "He'd rather compete internationally with great opponents than for example in the national 8 championships where he usually wins, but where they could beat him. Those competitions are 9 hard for him." Rafael recounted athletes who demonstrated signs of conflict avoidance: 10 it plays a big role what type of performance demands the coach and the environment 11 puts on the athlete. Because it's easy to create these extremely result-oriented performance environments [...] and that can be a strong foundation for you [as an 12 13 athlete to] create extreme performance demands that leads to a strong need for control in 14 relation to that, and perhaps even a fear of conflict and bringing it up with coaches. 15 Rafael, Elise, and Adam were concerned that when athletes experienced fear of failure and not perfect results, poor decision-making often followed. Some athletes under-16 17 compensated and consciously sought to underperform and withdraw effort, as Adam said: "he 18 doesn't dare to exert himself because of the risk that he may not perform as well as he hopes. 19 So then he doesn't really make a full effort." Other athletes overcompensated and adjusted 20 agreed training plans in counterproductive ways as Rafael explained: 21 when you have days off you're supposed to relax, but then they go to some gym or go 22 out running, quite heavily and so. And then they come back and the test results "You 23 don't recover. What do you do?" Well, then it comes out that they've been working out 24 by themselves when they were actually supposed to rest, because they think they will 25 improve.

To reduce their doubts, the consultants stated that several athletes continually sought
 confirmation and experienced the urge to double-check training schedules and plans. The
 need for a sense of control was suggested to be common which often led to inflexible
 behaviors and fear of change. Some athletes were reported to return to old behaviors to avoid
 situations where they felt less in control.

# 6 Outcomes

7 Reported consequences of the perfectionistic athletes' behaviors were underperformance and underachievement. Adam described an athlete who knowingly 8 underperformed due to fear of not performing perfectly: "with fear of not being perfect, [the 9 10 athlete] may play excessively simple and pass the ball back and not go into close situations" 11 Lucas, Elise, and Adam had observed that for many athletes the fear of failure was greater 12 than the will to succeed which led to passivity within their sport. Adam told: "he's worried 13 that he'll give it his all and then it's not as great as he hopes, so instead he doesn't bother 14 exerting himself."

15 Lucas also talked about how the athletes' perfectionism affected not only the performance but also the athletes' psychological well-being and general health. All 16 17 consultants had experience of working with some athletes who besides showing perfectionistic features also had different clinical disorders. Lucas further discussed how 18 19 athletes with perfectionistic features and with a strong focus on mainly their sport, with no 20 plan to fall back on, could leave the athletes with problems regarding career transitions: 21 all of a sudden you're 26, 30 years old with no education and without prospects, and in 22 the same sport in Sweden we have all those where it's gone bad, really bad, where 23 you're no longer somebody because you can't deliver results [...] so surely that can 24 become a problem in the future. For me that is, well, almost a given.

Adam expressed how perfectionism affected some athletes leading them to dropout of sport,
 as the negative emotions related to performance became too much: "One girl who's quit her
 sport because in the end everything became associated with anxiety, and was sitting crying
 when she was going to practice and so on. So I'm working with her right now"

5 Management of Perfectionism

6 When the consultants described the processes and methods for management of
7 perfectionism, three categories were generated: consultants' approaches; methods; and
8 challenges.

9 Consultants' Approaches

10 The consultants explained how the results of perfectionistic features were individualistic 11 – including to what degree the athletes were affected, and how they interpreted and reacted to 12 perceived demands from society, their sport and themselves. Lucas highlighted that 13 perfectionism could have both a positive and a negative side, something Elise also suggested 14 with the idea that how it affects the athlete depends on the individual:

15 Would they've become this successful without being perfectionistic? Maybe not. Would 16 they've felt better if they had not been so perfectionistic? Maybe. I think it has a lot to 17 do with how you interpret the stress reactions, the anxiety as well. Whether or not you 18 see it as something positive or negative. So that is also very individual. It's very hard. 19 Throughout the interviews the individual and their particular behaviors determined the 20 approaches that the consultants took. In particular, the consultants focused on how the 21 perfectionistic features affected the athletes' performances and well-being and in what 22 situations the athletes experienced problems. Different strategies were then applied depending 23 on the individual and the problems. An important aspect of the consultants' work was that 24 consultations were voluntary, and active participation from the athletes was vital. Adam and 25 Elise specified that they do not use the word perfectionism when working with athletes as

they had not specifically investigated if the athletes were perfectionists. They associated
 perfectionism with personality traits and felt it to be unnecessary to put a label on the athletes.
 *Methods*

As the athletes' behaviors were the consultants' focus, Elise, Rafael, and Adam
emphasized that the first step was a behavioral analysis. Then, all consultants used ACT
where the aim was to help the athletes accept their thoughts and emotions as well as
uncontrollable aspects of the surroundings. This was explained by Elise:

8 Teach the athletes to recognize and don't be afraid of these demands and these negative 9 thoughts. Instead, "yes, right, here they come" Then we register them and "okay" [...] 10 then you continue with what you were supposed to do instead of allowing it a lot of time 11 and energy.

Mindfulness and the Mindfulness-Acceptance-Commitment approach (MAC) were also mentioned, which had yielded positive results as Elise continued: "mindfulness and acceptance, these two methods are very good [...] it has a greater chance of functioning I think, than starting to work with thought stopping and forbid certain thoughts." Although Adam recalled how one athlete had some difficulties at the beginning with ACT: "we were talking that thoughts are just thoughts and so. 'But then positive thoughts that I have now are also just thoughts.' Then he took that as something negative."

Another approach that was used was exposure and response prevention where the athletes practiced situations that might evoke anxiety. Adam explained: "exposure with response prevention, to expose yourself to these things that create a lot of doubt and anxiety, for example, at practice, running against someone who's just as good." Lucas also recalled positive results through exposure combined with shifting focus when working with a diver who struggled with the 10 meters. They went up to the diving platform together and spent some minutes there:

# WORKING WITH PERFECTIONISTIC ELITE ATHLETES

1	I went to the very edge, and it's a strange feeling so high up, and then he started
2	laughing because I think it normalized it for him, he was the comfortable one up there
3	[] then he walked to the edge and jumped [] afterwards I asked "what did you think
4	about?" and he answered, "I was thinking about you standing here."
5	Cognitive restructuring and reframing was also reported by all consultants as frequently used
6	methods to re-evaluate or provide a different perspective on situations through acceptance.
7	The consultants highlighted that the strategy helped the athletes to refocus even when the
8	surroundings were experienced as distracting or difficult, as Rafael explained:
9	work on learning how to say that there are things that you don't like that will happen.
10	But you have to accept that it happens nevertheless. So you can still do what you want,
11	which in this case is perform.
12	Other strategies included psychological skills training. Lucas, Elise, and Adam used goal
13	setting where the athletes were given the task of setting process-based goals and not only
14	outcome-based goals which was often the case. Attention control was frequently used as well
15	as a focus on coping strategies.
16	All consultants reported that an important part of working with the athletes was
17	educating them in the different methods being used. Through education, the consultants aimed
18	to increase the athletes' own understanding of the techniques, and raise their awareness of the
19	physiological and psychological effects of stress and negative thoughts. Through homework
20	assignments, the athletes were also encouraged to reflect more on their thoughts and
21	interpretations of events as well as practice reducing the need to control the environment.
22	Challenges
23	The methods generally yielded good results according to the consultants, however, they
24	identified various challenges. Elise and Lucas highlighted the risk of encouraging the athletes'

25 perfectionism by promoting perfectionistic behaviors and replacing their safety behaviors

with new ones. Therefore, it was important to examine the athletes' approach to the work and
 be aware of one's own behaviors, as Elise expressed:

These people can be so nice to work with because they do exactly as you say [...] very confirming, for yourself, and they listen and they take it all in [...] you have to be very careful and get them to understand "but wait a minute, is it your perfectionistic side that is answering me now or?" [...] [get them to] reflect "what do you think happens if you don't do it [the assignment]?"

8 Speaking to this issue, behaviors and feelings of doubt were at times difficult to change for
9 the athletes, as Adam explained: "he got as an assignment to not check [his training schedule],
10 he checked his training schedule 100 times a day to feel that he was on track. He couldn't do
11 that."

12 Another challenge raised by all consultants was the performance environment. All 13 consultants expressed that the perfectionistic features that the athletes demonstrated had in 14 some way contributed to their success in sport. Several athletes appeared to have had 15 perfectionistic features since a young age, with society and the performance environment 16 reinforcing the perfectionistic behaviors and attitudes. Elise and Rafael articulated that the 17 messages the coaches gave at practice were at times contradictory to the help being provided. 18 Specifically, the coaches' behaviors and attitudes often reinforced and encouraged the 19 athletes' perfectionism, through praise, comments, and focusing on results. Adam even stated 20 that many coaches seek perfectionistic behaviors in their athletes: "many coaches strive for 21 these features, for people who do extra workouts and who stays after practice and comes early 22 and follows their schedule" Although coaches may not always consciously reinforce 23 perfectionism, their behaviors often do, as Elise expressed: "the coaches are often a bit 24 clumsy, because of course it's really nice to have an athlete who only does what you're asking 25 and does it to a 150 percent."

Lucas and Rafael also reported that other important persons in the athletes' lives, for
 example parents, friends and teammates, influenced the athletes through their opinions. Lucas
 described:

4 if you have a strong connection to the coach who constantly focuses on results, then that
5 will probably [have an] affect. If you have a strong connection to mom and dad who
6 always ask how it went, which place you got, then that will have the largest effect.
7 To be most effective, Lucas and Rafael stressed the importance of working together with
8 coaches and other specialists that the athletes came in contact with, which sometimes
9 involved education of the methods used.

Transitions from a sports club to a sports program, or from amateur to professional, was mentioned by all consultants as a challenging and influential factor, with higher demands and greater opponents which often required greater commitment and investment in the sport. For example, entering a sports program, the athletes were exposed to supporting staff such as physiologists and dieticians, all encouraging the athletes to focus on details to improve and optimize their performance. Rafael discussed how the help from supporting staff could indirectly fuel perfectionism in athletes and make it more difficult to address:

17at this level there is supporting staff in practically every area, for nutrition, for18physiology, for psychology, everything. And they're constantly informing us that we19should try to refine my performance as much as possible. Constantly think about what20we eat, how we sleep, and what we do. And of course, if you already from the21beginning have tendencies for perfectionism, then you get unbelievable stimulation and22can even use all these people around you as stimuli.

23

#### Discussion

The purpose of the study was to explore the views and experiences of sport psychology
consultants regarding working with perfectionistic elite athletes and their use of CBT.

Consultants highlighted the pervasive nature of perfectionism and how it was evident in 1 2 attitudes, emotions, behaviors, and outcomes for athletes. The consultants found 3 perfectionism in athletes to manifest in various ways many of which were problematic, and that this depended highly on the individual. They also reported using a range of CBT 4 techniques and found them to be largely effective in supporting these athletes. However, some 5 6 of the challenges they noted in working to reduce perfectionism included how perfectionistic 7 features themselves interfered with their work as well as how aspects of the sport environment 8 reinforced perfectionism.

9 In regards to the athletes themselves, consultants reported that perfectionistic athletes 10 expressed extreme mindsets where they were never satisfied, and displayed an "all or 11 nothing" attitude. Athletes often had a strong attachment to their sport, ruminated over 12 mistakes, overgeneralized, and showed signs of pessimism. Anxiety, doubt and fear of failure 13 were also reported to be common among perfectionistic athletes by the consultants. These 14 accounts mirror some of those in other qualitative research that have emphasised the negative 15 aspects of perfectionism (e.g., Hill et al., 2015). As such, there appears to be some confluence 16 between experiences of the consultants and perfectionistic athletes themselves. We note, 17 though, that here many of the athletes appear somewhat more extreme particularly in the 18 manner in which their perfectionism impacted their lives broadly, as opposed to being 19 domain-specific (e.g., Dunn et al., 2005).

Some of the more revealing findings in regards to perfectionistic athletes focused on
issues that are underrepresented in previous research. The notion of perfectionistic
vulnerability or reactivity has been touched upon elsewhere, including quantitative research
that have sought to examine responses to achievement difficulties (e.g., Curran & Hill, 2018).
However, the role of what might be considered relatively minor setbacks – disruptions to
plans, changes in schedules or diet – is not well represented in existing research and, based on

1 accounts here, may play a significant role in regards to emotions, thoughts, and behaviors of 2 perfectionistic athletes. Similarly, how perfectionism might influence stress, burnout and 3 coping are among some of the most examined issues in research in this area (Gustafsson et al., 4 2017). However, the influence of perfectionism on career transitions and sport dropout, less 5 so, and worthy of additional consideration and attention based on the current findings. 6 All consultants used different CBT techniques when working with perfectionistic 7 athletes. Some of the traditional CBT techniques which were adopted included mindfulness, 8 exposure, response prevention, cognitive restructuring, and psychological skills training 9 techniques (e.g., goal setting). These approaches were largely viewed as effective by the 10 consultants, as has been found to be the case in formal tests of the efficacy of CBT for 11 perfectionism (Handley et al., 2015). More contemporary CBT techniques were also 12 mentioned such as ACT and MAC. Although the evidence base for these techniques as they 13 apply to perfectionism is less developed, indication here is that sport practitioners are using 14 these techniques and they believe them to be effective when working with athletes. These 15 novel findings suggest there is merit in exploring these techniques further as well as formally 16 evaluating their effectiveness.

17 What is often missing in studies examining the effectiveness of these and other 18 techniques is an account of the context and its role and impact on applied practice. There are 19 previous accounts of how perfectionism can interfere with the process of addressing 20 perfectionism (Egan et al., 2013). This was also evident here. However, for the first time, in 21 the current study we heard accounts that addressing perfectionism in sport may be particularly 22 difficult due to the context itself. The language used by coaches and support staff, how the 23 sport environment is created to optimise performance, and the sharp focus on performance 24 improvement of even the smallest kind were considered to provide a difficult backdrop by the 25 consultants when they presented the challenging view that pursuing perfection may be

problematic. In doing so, the findings speak to the relevance of interpersonal sources of perfectionism in sport as exemplified within existing measures and associated empirical evidence (e.g., Gotwals & Dunn, 2009; Madigan et al., 2019). When working with perfectionistic athletes, sport psychology consultants will need to be aware of this unique challenge and adopt an approach that is sensitive to this context. The most successful and effective interventions will therefore be those that are able to work within this type of ethos and incorporate others (coaches and support staff).

8 One of the related challenges that consultants may face is the idea that attempting to 9 reduce PC may reduce PS or, inadvertently, decrease the motivation of athletes. This is a 10 complex issue. PC and PS are typically positively correlated and their overlap has been 11 suggested to be important in understanding the energising effects of perfectionism – both 12 reflecting a conditional sense of acceptance (Hill, 2014). In this regard, seeking for athletes to 13 be less perfectionistic could possibly have implications for motivation and performance. We think there are important considerations, though. The effects of PS are best described as 14 15 ambiguous (Hill et al., 2018). As such, it is not currently clear if athletes would necessarily be worse off forgoing this energising factor. Researchers would likely differ in their perspective 16 17 on this issue but we believe not. This is because, in our view, there are important differences 18 between pursuing perfection and pursuing high (or exceptionally high) standards. Take, for 19 example, the notion of excellencism as an alternative to perfectionism (Gaudreau, 2019). Key 20 to this approach is the notion that athletes may be able to pursue excellence without costs to 21 motivation, performance, or wellbeing that can characterise the pursuit of perfection. 22 Implementing this shift may pose a range of challenges for consultants, particularly in the 23 context of elite sport. However, the idea of pursuing excellence does at least offer one viable 24 alternative to perfectionism that may be practically useful for consultants.

1 One important issue to highlight is that the more positive accounts of the experiences of 2 athletes found in other studies were less evident here, with fewer mentions of possible 3 benefits of perfectionism (e.g., Gotwals & Spencer-Cavaliere, 2014). This may be due to the 4 experiences of these particular consultants or the way in which their role means they are more 5 likely to encounter perfectionistic athletes who are experiencing performance or other 6 difficulties. Alternatively, it may reflect the way the consultants understood perfectionism as a 7 more negative personal quality. The educational training in CBT among all consultants in the 8 present study make this a strong possibility. CBT and psychotherapy, generally, are grounded 9 in clinical and counselling psychology where perfectionism has historically been viewed as 10 problematic (Lloyd et al., 2015). Moreover, when using these approaches there is a sharp 11 focus on techniques and skills that address the problems associated with that perfectionism. 12 As such, the consultants may be better versed in the notion of negative perfectionism. 13 Additional accounts of perfectionism are required from other sport psychology consultants to 14 fully understand the influence of perfectionism and may act as a counterpoint to the 15 experiences of those interviewed here. 16 Based on the accounts in this study our sense is that the consultants are likely focusing

17 on a certain subtype of perfectionism – mixed perfectionism (high PS/high PC). Their 18 accounts of perfectionism align with previous qualitative research that has shown this subtype 19 to be associated with heightened threat and anxiety, and lower unconditional self-acceptance 20 (Hill et al., 2020), as well as experiencing low satisfaction from success and negative response 21 to failure (Gotwals & Tamminen, 2020). Coupled with the idea that these consultants are 22 more likely to encounter athletes who are experiencing difficulties and are seeking support, 23 the accounts may be best viewed as a representation of the negative aspects of being 24 perfectionistic in sport. Regardless, it is clear that to work effectively with perfectionistic 25 athletes sport psychology consultants will need knowledge of the differences between PC and

PS, how they coexist, and their impact on athletes, so they can differentiate between athletes
and tailor the support they provide.

# 3 Conclusion

4 The accounts of sport psychology consultants who have worked with perfectionistic

5 athletes indicate that perfectionism manifests in important ways, many of which require

6 support. CBT techniques are being used and considered effective in this context. However,

7 practitioners should be aware of the complexities of perfectionism and the potential

8 difficulties of addressing it and its negative effects in the sporting environment.

1	References
2	Birks, M., Chapman, Y., & Francis, K. (2008). Memoing in qualitative research: Probing data
3	and processes. Journal of Research in Nursing, 13, 68-75.
4	https://doi.org/10.1177/1744987107081254
5	Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2019). Reflecting on reflexive thematic analysis. Qualitative
6	Research in Sport, Exercise and Health, 11(4), 589-597.
7	https://doi.org/10.1080/2159676X.2019.1628806
8	Curran, T., & Hill, A. P. (2018). A test of perfectionistic vulnerability following competitive
9	failure among college athletes. Journal of Sport & Exercise Psychology, 40(5), 269-279.
10	https://doi.org/10.1123/jsep.2018-0059
11	Dunn, J. G. H., Gotwals, J. K., & Causgrove Dunn, J. (2005). An examination of the domain
12	specificity of perfectionism among intercollegiate student-athletes. Personality and
13	Individual Differences 38(6), 1439-1448. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.paid.2004.09.009
14	Egan, S. J., Piek, J. P., Dyck, M. J., Rees, C. S., & Hagger, M. S. (2013). A clinical
15	investigation of motivation to change standards and cognitions about failure in
16	perfectionism. Behavioural and Cognitive Psychotherapy, 41, 565-578.
17	https://doi.org/10.1017/S135246581200063X
18	Eklund, R. C. (1993). Considerations for gaining entry to conduct sport psychology field
19	research. The Sport Psychologist, 7, 232-243. https://doi.org/10.1123/tsp.7.3.232
20	Gaudreau, P. (2019). On the distinction between personal standards perfectionism and
21	excellencism: A theory elaboration and research agenda. Perspectives on Psychological
22	Science, 14(2), 197-215. https://doi.org/10.1177/1745691618797940
23	Gotwals, J. K., & Dunn, J. G. H. (2009). A multi-method multi-analytic approach to
24	establishing internal construct validity evidence: The Sport Multidimensional

# WORKING WITH PERFECTIONISTIC ELITE ATHLETES

1	Perfectionism Scale 2. Measurement in Physical Education and Exercise Science, 13(2),
2	71-92. https://doi.org/10.1080/10913670902812663
3	Gotwals, J. K., & Spencer-Cavaliere, N. (2014). Intercollegiate perfectionistic athletes'
4	perspectives on achievement: Contributions to the understanding and assessment of
5	perfectionism in sport. International Journal of Sport Psychology, 45(4), 271-297.
6	https://doi.org/10.7352/ijsp.2014.45.271
7	Gotwals, J. K., Stoeber, J., Dunn, J. G. H., & Stoll, O. (2012). Are perfectionistic strivings in
8	sport adaptive? A systematic review of confirmatory, contradictory, and mixed
9	evidence. Canadian Psychology, 54(4), 263-279. https://doi.org/10.1037/a0030288
10	Gotwals, J. K., & Tamminen, K. A. (2020). Intercollegiate perfectionistic athletes'
11	perspectives on success and failure in sport. Journal of Applied Sport Psychology.
12	https://doi.org/10.1080/10413200.2020.1740826
13	Gustafsson, H., DeFreese, J. D., & Madigan, D. J. (2017). Athlete burnout: Review and
14	recommendations. Current Opinion in Psychology, 16, 109-113.
15	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.copsyc.2017.05.002
16	Handley, A. K., Egan, S. J., Kane, R. T., & Rees, C. S. (2015). A randomised controlled trial
17	of group cognitive behavioural therapy for perfectionism. Behaviour Research and
18	<i>Therapy</i> , 68, 37-47. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.brat.2015.02.006
19	Hayes, S. C., Wilson, K. G., Gifford, E. V., Follette, V. M., & Strosahl, K. (1996).
20	Experiential avoidance and behavioral disorders: A functional dimensional approach to
21	diagnosis and treatment. Journal of Consulting and Clinical Psychology, 64(6), 1152-
22	1168. https://doi.org/10.1037/0022-006X.64.6.1152
23	Hill, A. P. (2014). Perfectionistic strivings and the perils of partialling. International Journal
24	of Sport and Exercise Psychology, 12(4), 302-315.
25	https://doi.org/10.1080/1612197X.2014.919602

1	Hill, A. P., & Madigan, D. J. (2017). A short review of perfectionism in sport, dance and
2	exercise: out with the old, in with the $2 \times 2$ . Current Opinion in Psychology, 16, 72-77.
3	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.copsyc.2017.04.021
4	Hill, A. P., Mallinson-Howard, S. H., & Jowett, G. E. (2018). Multidimensional perfectionism
5	in sport: A meta-analytical review. Sport, Exercise, and Performance Psychology, 7(3),
6	235-270. https://doi.org/10.1037/spy0000125
7	Hill, A. P., Mallinson-Howard, S. H., Madigan, D. J., & Jowett, G. E. (2020). Perfectionism
8	in sport, dance, and exercise: An extended review and reanalysis. In G. Tenenbaum &
9	R. C. Eklund (Eds.) Handbook of sport psychology (4th ed., pp. 121-157). Wiley.
10	Hill, A. P., Witcher, C. S. G., Gotwals, J. K., & Leyland, A. F. (2015). A qualitative study of
11	perfectionism among self-identified perfectionists in sport and the performing arts.
12	Sport, Exercise, and Performance Psychology, 4(4), 237-253.
13	https://doi.org/10.1037/spy0000041
14	Hofmann, S. G., Asmundson, G. J. G., & Beck, A. T. (2013). The science of cognitive
15	therapy. Behavior Therapy, 44(2), 199-212. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.beth.2009.01.007
16	Lloyd, S., Schmidt, U., Khondoker, M., & Tchanturia, K. (2015). Can psychological
17	interventions reduce perfectionism? A systematic review and meta-analysis.
18	Behavioural and Cognitive Psychotherapy, 43(6), 705-731.
19	https://doi.org/10.1017/S1352465814000162
20	Madigan, D. J., Curran, T., Stoeber, J., Hill, A. P., Smith, M. M., & Passfield, L. (2019).
21	Development of perfectionism in junior athletes: A three-sample study of coach and
22	parental pressure. Journal of Sport and Exercise Psychology, 41(3), 167–175.
23	https://doi.org/10.1123/jsep.2018-0287

1	Mallinson-Howard, S. H., Knight, C. J., Hill, A. P., & Hall, H. K. (2018). The $2 \times 2$ model of
2	perfectionism and youth sport participation: A mixed-methods approach. Psychology of
3	Sport and Exercise, 36, 162-173. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.psychsport.2018.02.011
4	Malterud, K., Siersma, V. D., & Guassora, A. D. (2016). Sample size in qualitative interview
5	studies: Guided by information power. Qualitative Health Research, 26(13), 1753-1760.
6	https://doi.org/10.1177/1049732315617444
7	Ong, C. W., Barney, J. L., Barrett, T. S., Lee, E. B., Levin, M. E., & Twohig, M. P. (2019a).
8	The role of psychological inflexibility and self-compassion in acceptance and
9	commitment therapy for clinical perfectionism. Journal of Contextual Behavioral
10	Science, 13, 7-16. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jcbs.2019.06.005
11	Ong, C. W., Lee, E. B., Krafft, J., Terry, C. L., Barrett, T. S., Levin, M. E., & Twohig, M. P.
12	(2019b). A randomized controlled trial of acceptance and commitment therapy for
13	clinical perfectionism. Journal of Obsessive-Compulsive and Related Disorders, 22,
14	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jocrd.2019.100444
15	Sellars, P. A., Evans, L., & Thomas, O. (2016). The effects of perfectionism in elite sport:
16	Experiences of unhealthy perfectionists. The Sport Psychologist, 30(3), 219-230.
17	https://doi.org/10.1123/tsp.2014-0072
18	SFS 2003:460. Lag (2003:460) om etikprövning av forskning som avser människor. Lag
19	(2003:460) om etikprövning av forskning som avser människor Svensk
20	författningssamling 2003:2003:460 t.o.m. SFS 2021:612 - Riksdagen
21	Smith, B, & McGannon, K. R. (2018). Developing rigor in qualitative research: Problems
22	and opportunities within sport and exercise psychology. International Review of Sport
23	and Exercise Psychology, 11(1), 101-121.
24	https://doi.org/10.1080/1750984X.2017.1317357
25	Swedish Research Council. (2017). Good research practice. Good research practice (vr.se)

- 1 Terry, G., Hayfield, N., Clarke, V., & Braun, V. (2017). Thematic analysis. In C. Willig, &
- 2 W. Stainton Rogers (Eds.), *The SAGE handbook of qualitative research in psychology*
- 3 (2<sup>nd</sup> ed., pp. 17-37). SAGE Publications. https://uwe-
- 4 repository.worktribe.com/output/888518
- 5 Yilmaz, K. (2013). Comparison of quantitative and qualitative research traditions:
- 6 Epistemological, theoretical, and methodological differences. *European Journal of*
- 7 *Education*, 48(2), 311-325. https://doi.org/10.1111/ejed.12014

1		Appendix
2		Interview Guide
3		
4	•	Could you tell me about your experiences from working with perfectionistic athletes?
5	•	How does perfectionism manifest among the athletes? (Consequences)
6	•	In what situations does perfectionism show?
7	•	Some researchers say that perfectionism is positive and others that it is negative. What
8		is your experience from working with the athletes?
9	•	From your experiences, what are the perceived contributing factors that increase
10		perfectionistic behaviors and attitudes among the athletes?
11	•	How do you work with athletes that have perfectionistic features? (Any specific
12		techniques?)
13	•	From your experience, how has the outcome been?
14	•	What are your general views on perfectionism in sport, from your experiences as a
15		consultant?
16		
17		Suggestions for follow-up questions/probes:
18	•	Since you started with CBT, how do you look at methods for management of
19		perfectionism?
20	•	If and how have you worked with e.g., ACT, mindfulness?
21	•	Do I understand you correctly that you meant?
22	•	How do you handle this in an elite sport environment?
23	•	Could you tell me a bit more about that athlete? (Background)
24	•	Do you work with any of the athletes today?